



# **THE STATE OF INDIA'S PUBLIC SERVICES**

**BENCHMARKS FOR THE NEW MILLENNIUM**



# OBJECTIVES

- *To provide a well focused and independent assessment of key public services using citizen feedback & direct observation of facilities;*
- *To create an independent database & benchmarks to measure progress and performance over time*
- *Stimulate state - civil society dialogues on critical issues*



# APPROACH

- *Survey of households to get a rating of services across various measures of quality, reliability, satisfaction etc.*
- *Assessment of service infrastructure on indicators of their functioning.*

## **Selected services**

- ▶▶ *Drinking water*
- ▶▶ *School education & child care*
- ▶▶ *Health & sanitation*
- ▶▶ *PDS ( fair price shop)*
- ▶▶ *Public transport (buses)*



# METHODOLOGY

- Expert Consultation on conceptual building blocks
- Joint research design by PAC & ORG-MARG
- 3 pronged approach: Household Survey, Assessment of Facilities & Village Profiles.
- Strict Monitoring: Quality Checks, Spot Checks, Accompanied Checks and Back Checks





# **SAMPLE SIZE**

- **24 States, 115 districts, 36542 HHs - 26797 Rural & 9745 Urban**
- **2304 Villages for VPS**
- **Observation of 12,256 Facilities**
- **Stratification by Rural / Urban, Village Size/ Town Class - Rural into Socio Cultural Regions (SCR)**
- **Reliability of Sample**
- **Analysis by Rural / Urban, SCRs, Village Class, Caste & SLI**



# COMPARISONS ACROSS SERVICES

## Dimensions of Probe

- ➔ Ease of Access to facilities
- ➔ Usage of public services
- ➔ Quality/Reliability
- ➔ Satisfaction



# PHYSICAL ACCESS TO FACILITIES

- Access to a protected public drinking water source within 100 mts: 55%
- Access to a Fair Price Shop within the village / area: 72%
- Access to a medical facility within 1 kms: 41%
- Access to an educational facility within 1 km: 66%
- Access to a public bus throughout the year: 54%



# USAGE OF PUBLIC SERVICES

- Users of protected public drinking water sources: 62%
- Users of a government medical facility: 52%
- Users buying items from a FPS: 72%
- Users of government schools: 78%
- Users of public buses: 35%





# QUALITY / RELIABILITY

- No breakdown of public drinking water sources: 76%
- Presence of doctors at public health facilities: 70%
- Full satisfaction with the behaviour of government primary school teachers: 16%
- Regular availability of staple food grain: 23%
- Full satisfaction with punctuality of public buses: 20%



# SATISFACTION

- Full satisfaction with adequacy & quality of drinking water: 22%
- Full satisfaction with behaviour of doctors: 14%
- Full satisfaction with availability of supplies, quality of supplies & fairness of fair price shopkeepers: 8%
- Full satisfaction with quality of physical infrastructure in primary schools: 10%
- Full satisfaction with frequency of public buses & behaviour of conductors: 21%
- Dissatisfaction highest for PDS & Primary Schools



# KEY FINDINGS

- Great variations between services
- Across services, Drinking Water comes out ahead; however, in ease of access it lags behind
- Dependence on public sources is high for PDS and primary education and low for Drinking Water, Health Services & Road Transport
- Scores on full satisfaction generally on the low side. A large proportion of users are partially dissatisfied.
- Services with a high element of human interaction report significantly lower satisfaction.



# COMPARISON ACROSS STATES

How States Compare for **Access, Usage, Quality/Reliability & Satisfaction** for the five key services





# DRINKING WATER

ATTRIBUTE	TOP PERFORMERS	POOR PERFORMERS
ACCESS	Tamil Nadu, Himachal Pradesh, Maharashtra Karnataka, Gujarat	Assam, Bihar, Kerala, Punjab Uttar Pradesh
USAGE	Tamil Nadu, Himachal Pradesh, Andhra Pradesh West Bengal, Orissa	Assam, Bihar, Kerala, Punjab Uttar Pradesh
QUALITY/ RELIABILITY	Maharashtra, Orissa, W.Bengal, Karnataka, Madhya Pradesh	Rajasthan, Tamil Nadu, Bihar, Uttar Pradesh, Haryana
SATISFACTION	Uttar Pradesh, Tamil Nadu, Gujarat, Andhra Pradesh, Karnataka	Punjab, Orissa, Kerala, Rajasthan, Maharashtra

## SECTOR RANKS

**TOP 5** : Himachal Pradesh, Tamil Nadu, Maharashtra, Karnataka, West Bengal

**BOTTOM 5** : Punjab, Kerala, Bihar, Assam, Rajasthan



# SCHOOL EDUCATION

<b>STATES</b>	<b>TOP PERFORMERS</b>	<b>BOTTOM PERFORMERS</b>
<b>ACCESS</b>	Maharashtra, Rajasthan, Gujrat, Andhra Pradesh & Haryana	Kerala, West Bengal, Assam, Punjab & Himachal Pradesh
<b>USAGE</b>	West Bengal, Orissa, Tamil Nadu, Maharashtra, Madhya Pradesh	Punjab, Haryana, Uttar Pradesh, Kerala & Bihar
<b>QUALITY / RELIABILITY</b>	Tamil Nadu, Karnataka, Gujarat, Maharashtra & West Bengal	Punjab, Orissa, Haryana, Himachal Pradesh & Rajasthan
<b>SATISFACTION</b>	Tamil Nadu, Karnataka, Gujarat, Maharashtra & Kerala	Punjab, Orissa, Bihar, Himachal Pradesh & Rajasthan

## SECTOR RANKS

**TOP 5** : Maharashtra, Tamil Nadu, Gujarat, Karnataka & Andhra Pradesh

**BOTTOM 5** : Punjab, Kerala, Bihar, Assam, Himachal Pradesh



# HEALTH SERVICES

ATTRIBUTE		TOP PERFORMERS	POOR PERFORMERS
ACCESS		Punjab, W.Bengal, Haryana, Rajasthan & Maharashtra	Andhra Pradesh, Bihar, Karnataka, Assam & Tamil Nadu
USAGE		Assam, W.Bengal, Rajasthan Maharashtra & Orissa	Uttar Pradesh, Bihar, Punjab, Karnataka & Haryana
QUALITY/ RELIABILITY		Gujarat, Maharashtra, Punjab Himachal Pradesh & Orissa	Andhra Pradesh, Kerala, Rajasthan, W. Bengal & Madhya Pradesh
SATISFACTION		Tamil Nadu, Gujarat, Karnataka, Maharashtra & Uttar Pradesh	Orissa, Punjab, Rajasthan, Assam & Kerala

## SECTOR RANKS

**TOP 5** : Maharashtra, Gujarat, Haryana, West Bengal & Orissa

**BOTTOM 5** : Andhra Pradesh, Assam, Kerala, Bihar & Madhya Pradesh





# PUBLIC DISTRIBUTION SYSTEM

<b>STATES</b>	<b>TOP PERFORMERS</b>	<b>POOR PERFORMERS</b>
<b>ACCESS</b>	Orissa, Kerala, Haryana, Tamil Nadu & Himachal Pradesh	Madhya Pradesh, Gujarat, Karnataka, Bihar & Assam
<b>USAGE</b>	Assam, Orissa, Tamil Nadu, Uttar Pradesh & Andhra Pradesh	Maharashtra, Punjab, Karnataka, Himachal Pradesh & Madhya Pradesh
<b>QUALITY/ RELIABILITY</b>	Tamil Nadu, Andhra Pradesh, Karnataka, Kerala & Gujarat	Punjab, Haryana, Uttar Pradesh, Bihar & Rajasthan
<b>SATISFACTION</b>	Tamil Nadu, Andhra Pradesh, Karnataka, Gujarat & Uttar Pradesh	Orissa, West Bengal, Kerala, Maharashtra & Punjab

## SECTOR RANKS

**TOP 5** :Tamil Nadu, Andhra Pradesh, Kerala, Gujarat & Karnataka

**BOTTOM 5** :Punjab, Rajasthan, West Bengal, Maharashtra & Bihar





# TRANSPORT

<b>STATES</b>	<b>TOP PERFORMERS</b>	<b>POOR PERFORMERS</b>
<b>ACCESS</b>	Andhra Pradesh, Maharashtra, Tamil Nadu, Karnataka & Himachal Pradesh	Bihar, Orissa, West Bengal, Assam & Utta Pradesh
<b>USAGE</b>	Andhra Pradesh, Maharashtra, Tamil Nadu, Gujarat & Karnataka	Bihar, Orissa, Assam, West Bengal & Madhya Pradesh
<b>QUALITY/ RELIABILITY</b>	Gujarat, Tamil Nadu, Uttar Pradesh, West Bengal & Karnataka	Orissa, Bihar, Assam, Punjab & Rajasthan
<b>SATISFACTION</b>	Gujarat, Tamil Nadu, Uttar Pradesh, West Bengal & Karnataka	Orissa, Assam, Punjab, Rajasthan & Kerala

## SECTOR RANKS

**TOP 5** :Tamil Nadu, Andhra Pradesh ,Maharashtra, Gujarat & Karnataka

**BOTTOM 5** :Punjab, Rajasthan, Bihar, Orissa & Assam



# PUBLIC SERVICES & WEAKER SECTIONS THE FRAMEWORK

Separate assessments in relation to:

- Households with Income-Capability Disadvantage  
(Kutcha house, CWE illiterate, Primary sector employment)
- Households in small villages (Class C)
- Households in rural areas



# **PUBLIC SERVICES & WEAKER SECTIONS POSITIVE FINDINGS**

- No Variation in Access to protected Public Water Source
- Same Proportion Possess Ration Cards & Use PDS
- Get PDS Foodgrains with Same Regularity as Others



# **PUBLIC SERVICES & WEAKER SECTIONS ISSUES**

- **More breakdowns of Public Water Sources**
- **Low Proportion of Health Facilities within 1 kms**
- **Low satisfaction with behaviour of Doctors & Paramedics (ICD & Rural)**
- **Low satisfaction with frequency of Public Buses (Small villages & Rural)**
- **Low satisfaction with quantity of supplies & Fairness of Fair Price Shopkeepers (ICD)**
- **High dissatisfaction with quality of toilets in Primary Schools (ICD)**





# **PUBLIC SERVICES & WEAKER SECTIONS ISSUES**

- Low availability of Public Buses (Small Villages)
- Low availability of schools within 1 km (Small Villages)
- Fewer Anganwadis (Small Villages)
- Low satisfaction with Punctuality of Public Buses (Rural)
- Low availability of Doctors at Govt. Facilities (Rural)



# IMPLICATIONS FOR ACTION

- Public Policy Redesign Issues
- Intra state & Inter State Variations
- Management Strategies for Improving Effectiveness
- Strategies to Reach Disadvantaged Sections
- Role for Local 'Voice' & Leadership



# ASSESSING GOVERNANCE (Public Services)

- **EFFECTIVENESS / EFFICIENCY**
- **TRANSPARENCY**
- **RESPONSIVENESS**
- **EQUITY**



# How States Measure up to...

<b>TOP PERFORMERS</b>	<b>POOR PERFORMERS</b>
😊 Maharashtra	😞 Assam
😊 Gujarat	😞 Punjab
😊 Tamil Nadu	😞 Bihar





**THANK YOU**

